

---

## Doctrine Of Basic Structure

<sup>1</sup>Khalid Ali Khan Afridi

<sup>1</sup>Student, B.A. LL.B. (Honors) IV Year (VIII Semester) PSIT College of Law, Kanpur, Uttar Pradesh

Received: 25 September 2023 Accepted and Reviewed: 15 October 2023, Published : 01 Dec 2023

---

### Abstract

The Doctrine of Basic Structure is a fundamental principle that shapes the interpretation and scope of the Indian Constitution. This research paper examines the concept of the Doctrine of Basic Structure, its legal foundations and its implications for constitutional law in India. This research paper commence from exploring the concept of the Basic Structure Doctrine, its origin, significance and its role in preserving the democratic fabric of India's constitutional framework. This research paper describe how the doctrine ensures that the essential features of the Constitution cannot be amended or altered by the elected representatives without undermining the spirit and intent of the founding fathers. The Doctrine of Basic Structure first emerged as a judicial concept in the historic judgment of the Honorable Supreme Court in the case of Kesavananda Bharati v. State of Kerala in 1973<sup>1</sup>. Further, it highlights the articles in the Constitution of India<sup>2</sup> which plays a crucial role in defining the basic structure. Moreover, this research paper will explore the concept of the Basic Structure Doctrine with the relevant articles and landmark cases that have strengthened its significance in Indian constitutional law. Different judgments from the Supreme Court of India have further clarified and reaffirmed the position of the doctrine in the Indian constitutional framework. This research paper concludes by highlighting the significance of the Basic Structure Doctrine in safeguarding the essence and integrity of the Constitution.

**Keywords-** Doctrine of Basic Structure, Constitution, Article, Challenge, Significance, Amendment, Principle.

### Introduction

The Constitution of India adopted on January 26, 1950 serves as the foundation for the functioning of the world's largest democracy. It outlines the basic framework and principles upon which the Indian state operates. Within this vast framework the concept of the "Basic Structure Doctrine" has emerged as a crucial element in constitutional interpretation. This doctrine ensures that the essential features of the Constitution cannot be amended or altered by the elected representatives without undermining the spirit and intent of the founding fathers. The Constitution of India is the supreme law of the land and provides the framework for the functioning of the country. It not only defines the powers and responsibilities of the different organs of the government but also lays down the fundamental rights and principles that the state must follow. One of the key features of the Constitution is the doctrine of "Basic Structure which acts as a safeguard against any action that undermines the core values and principles of the Constitution. The Doctrine of Basic Structure is a concept that has had a profound impact on the interpretation and development of the Constitution of India. It underscores the idea that some certain fundamental principles and values underlie the Constitution and cannot be altered or destroyed by amendment or legislation.

### ORIGIN AND DEVELOPMENT OF THE DOCTRINE

---

<sup>1</sup> Kesavananda Bharati v. State of Kerala (1973) 4 SCC 225

<sup>2</sup> Constitution of India, 1950

The Doctrine of Basic Structure first emerged as a judicial concept in the historic Supreme Court judgment of *Kesavananda Bharati v. State of Kerala in 1973*<sup>3</sup>. In this case, the Supreme Court was called upon to determine whether the power of Parliament to amend the Constitution under Article 368 was unlimited or subject to certain implied limitations. The court in a landmark decision held that while Parliament had the power to amend the Constitution such power was not absolute. The judiciary introduced the concept of the "basic structure referring to the essential and inviolable elements of the Constitution that cannot be amended by the legislature under any circumstances. The court also articulated that the power to amend the Constitution does not include the power to destroy its basic structure. Over the years the Basic Structure Doctrine has been further refined and elucidated by subsequent Supreme Court judgments. Through these cases, the court has identified key aspects of the Constitution that form its basic structure such as the supremacy of the Constitution secularism federalism separation of powers, and the rule of law. These elements collectively ensure that the Constitution remains resilient and protects the rights and liberties of its citizens. The Doctrine of Basic Structure implies that the Constitution has certain fundamental features that cannot be tampered with as they constitute the essence of the Constitution itself. These fundamental features include but are not limited to democracy secularism federalism separation of powers and the protection of fundamental rights. Any amendment to the Constitution that seeks to destroy or alter these basic features would be ultra vires the powers of the Parliament and can be struck down by the judiciary.

### **RELEVANT ARTICLES**

Several articles in the Constitution of India play a crucial role in defining the basic structure. Some of the key articles are mentioned below:

- 1. Article 13<sup>4</sup>:** This article states that any law that is inconsistent with or in derogation of fundamental rights shall be void. The Supreme Court has interpreted this article to include constitutional amendments as well thereby empowering the Court to strike down amendments that violate the fundamental rights or the basic structure.
- 2. Article 21<sup>5</sup>:** This article guarantees the protection of life and personal liberty. The Supreme Court has held that this article includes within its ambit several rights such as the right to privacy dignity and a pollution-free environment. These rights are considered part of the basic structure and are immune from arbitrary amendments.
- 3. Article 32<sup>6</sup>:** This article provides the right to constitutional remedies and enables individuals to approach the Supreme Court for the enforcement of their fundamental rights. The Supreme Court has held that the right to access justice through Article 32 is an essential feature of the basic structure.
- 4. Article 368<sup>7</sup>:** This article enumerates the procedure for amending the Constitution. It is important to note that while the Parliament has the power to amend the Constitution it cannot abrogate or alter the basic structure of the Constitution.

### **LANDMARK CASES**

<sup>3</sup> Kesavananda Bharati v. State of Kerala (1973) 4 SCC 225

<sup>4</sup> Constitution of India, 1950, Article 13

<sup>5</sup> Constitution of India, 1950, Article 21

<sup>6</sup> Constitution of India, 1950, Article 32

<sup>7</sup> Constitution of India, 1950, Article 368

Since its inception the doctrine of basic structure has been a subject of debate and discussion. Different judgments from the Supreme Court of India have further clarified and reaffirmed the position of the doctrine in the Indian constitutional framework. Let's look at some of the landmark case laws:

**1. Kesavananda Bharati v. State of Kerala (1973)<sup>8</sup>:** This case is considered the foundation of the Basic Structure Doctrine. The Supreme Court by a narrow margin held that the Parliament's power to amend the Constitution under Article 368 is not unlimited and it cannot destroy the basic structure of the Constitution. The Court also outlined some of the features of the basic structure such as supremacy of the Constitution secularism federalism and separation of powers. These “basic features” or “basic structure” have been left undefined by the court intentionally providing scope for evolution and adaptation to the changing needs of society. However some elements such as the supremacy of the constitution democracy secularism separation of powers federalism and protection of fundamental rights are regarded as the core essentials that cannot be tampered with.

**2. Indira Gandhi v. Raj Narain (1975)<sup>9</sup>:** In this case, the Supreme Court declared that the power and jurisdiction of the Court under Article 32 and Article 136 are part of the basic structure of the Constitution. It held that the Parliament cannot alter or abrogate these powers.

**3. Minerva Mills v. Union of India (1980)<sup>10</sup>:** The Supreme Court held in this case that the basic structure doctrine is not limited to just fundamental rights but encompasses other principles as well such as the rule of law and judicial review.

**4. Supreme Court Advocates-on-Record Association vs. Union of India (1993)<sup>11</sup>:** In this case the court held that the independence of the judiciary is a part of the basic structure. It reaffirmed the principle that the judiciary has the power to review constitutional amendments for their conformity with the basic structure.

**5. S.R. Bommai v. Union of India (1994)<sup>12</sup>:** This case reaffirmed the importance of federalism as a basic structure of the Constitution. The Court held that any attempt by the central government to interfere with the federal structure of the Constitution would be unconstitutional.

### **PRINCIPLES ENSHRINED IN THE DOCTRINE OF BASIC STRUCTURE**

The Doctrine of Basic Structure encompasses several principle elements each crucial to the functioning of India's constitutional democracy. These principles include:

**1. Supremacy of the Constitution:** The Constitution is the supreme law of the land and any law inconsistent with its provisions is void. This principle ensures that all laws and actions of the government remain subservient to the Constitution.

**2. Rule of Law:** The principle of the rule of law establishes that all citizens regardless of their status are subject to the law. This principle ensures fairness justice and equality before the law.

<sup>8</sup> Kesavananda Bharati v. State of Kerala (1973) 4 SCC 225

<sup>9</sup> Indira Gandhi v. Raj Narain (1975) AIR 1590, 1975 SCC (2) 159

<sup>10</sup> Minerva Mills v. Union of India (1980) AIR 1789, 1981 SCR (1) 206

<sup>11</sup> Supreme Court Advocates-on-Record Association vs. Union of India (1993) 4 SCC 441

<sup>12</sup> S.R. Bommai v. Union of India (1994) AIR 1918, 1994 SCC (3) 1

**3. Democracy:** The basic structure upholds the democratic ideals by providing for free and fair elections representative government and fundamental rights that protect individual liberties. It ensures that power ultimately rests with the people.

**4. Separation of Powers:** The doctrine emphasizes the importance of the separation of powers among the executive legislative and judicial branches of government. It safeguards against the concentration of power and ensures checks and balances.

**5. Judicial Review:** The basic structure upholds the judiciary's power to interpret the Constitution and strike down laws and actions that violate its provisions. This principle ensures that the judiciary acts as a bulwark against potential excesses by the other branches of government.

## **PURPOSE**

### **1. Deterrent to Unconstitutional Amendments:**

The doctrine serves as a deterrent and effectively checks any attempt to make substantial changes that would compromise the basic structure of the Constitution. It prevents the ruling government from arbitrarily altering the constitutional framework to consolidate power or pursue their political agenda. This serves as a vital safeguard against a potential erosion of democratic principles and institutions.

### **2. Protecting Fundamental Rights and Liberties:**

The doctrine of basic structure acts as a shield for protecting fundamental rights and liberties enshrined in the Constitution. By imposing limitations on the scope of constitutional amendments it prevents any arbitrary curtailment of individual rights. This ensures that the principles of equality freedom of speech right to privacy and other liberties guaranteed under the Constitution remain inviolable and sacrosanct.

### **3. Preserving the Balance of Power:**

One of the essential features of the doctrine of basic structure is the preservation of the separation of powers. It safeguards the delicate balance among the executive legislative and judicial branches of government preventing any attempt to undermine the independence and effectiveness of these institutions.

### **4. Promoting Constitutional Consistency:**

The doctrine of basic structure promotes consistency and coherence within the constitutional framework. By preventing amendments that violate or contradict the underlying principles of the Constitution it ensures that the Constitution remains a living and adaptable document while maintaining its core values. This enhances legal certainty and stability in the governance system.

### **5. Evolution of the Doctrine:**

Over the years the doctrine of basic structure has evolved and expanded to incorporate new dimensions. The courts have shown flexibility in determining what constitutes the basic structure adapting it to the changing socio-political landscape. In India for instance the courts have added principles of federalism secularism and judicial review to the list of fundamental features.

## 6. International Influence:

The doctrine of basic structure has not been limited to India; it has gained recognition and influence internationally. Courts in countries like Bangladesh Nepal Pakistan and South Africa have also adopted and applied the basic structure doctrine to safeguard the integrity of their respective constitutions.

### CRITIQUES AND CHALLENGES

One of the biggest challenges to the Doctrine of Basic Structure is the difficulty in determining what constitutes the "basic structure" of a constitution. Since the concept itself is not explicitly defined in most constitutional texts its interpretation relies heavily on judicial decisions. However this lack of clarity has led to disagreements among legal scholars, judges and experts regarding the scope and content of the basic structure. This ambiguity makes it challenging to identify and protect the essential components of a constitution as different individuals may have varying interpretations.

Another challenge arises from the potential conflict between constitutional amendments and the basic structure. While amendments are a legitimate and necessary means to adapt a constitution to changing social economic and political realities they can also be misused to alter or undermine the basic structure. This creates a tension between the need for flexibility in constitutional provisions and the imperative to preserve the core principles and values that ensure the proper functioning of a constitution. Striking a balance between these two considerations can be challenging as it requires a careful examination of each amendment's impact on the basic structure.

Furthermore, the Doctrine of Basic Structure faces challenges in its application to different legal systems and traditions. It is predominantly associated with the Indian legal system where it was first introduced by the Supreme Court in the landmark case of *Kesavananda Bharati v. State of Kerala*. However other countries and legal systems may have different approaches to constitutional interpretation and amendment. The applicability of the basic structure doctrine in these contexts becomes questionable as it may be seen as an interference with national sovereignty and the underlying principles of judicial review. Thus the Doctrine of Basic Structure may not be universally recognized or accepted limiting its effectiveness as a safeguard against constitutional violations.

Additionally, the Doctrine of Basic Structure can be undermined by political and institutional factors. The enforcement of the doctrine relies on an independent and impartial judiciary that is willing and able to protect the basic structure against encroachments by the executive or legislative branches. However in many countries the judiciary may be subject to political influence lack resources or face challenges to its independence. In such instances the effectiveness of the Doctrine of Basic Structure is compromised as there may be limited or insufficient checks on constitutional amendments or actions that violate the basic structure.

Moreover, the Doctrine of Basic Structure faces challenges regarding its dynamic nature and adaptability to societal changes. Constitutions are living documents that need to evolve with the needs and aspirations of the people. However the rigidity of the basic structure doctrine may impede necessary constitutional reforms and hinder progress. There is a delicate balance between preserving the core principles of a constitution and allowing for necessary adaptations. Striking this balance is essential to ensure the continued relevance and effectiveness of the doctrine in a changing world.

While the Doctrine of Basic Structure is a vital mechanism for preserving the core principles and values of a constitution it faces numerous challenges that question its applicability and effectiveness. The difficulty in defining the basic structure the potential conflict with constitutional amendments varying legal systems and traditions political and institutional factors and the adaptability of the doctrine all contribute to these challenges. Despite these obstacles efforts must be made to address and overcome these challenges to ensure the continued protection of democratic and fundamental rights and the preservation of the rule of law.

### **SIGNIFICANCE AND IMPLICATIONS OF THE DOCTRINE**

The Doctrine of Basic Structure holds significant importance in the Indian constitutional setup. It acts as a safeguard against any undue excesses or unconstitutional amendments that may be attempted by the legislature. This doctrine ensures that the fundamental principles and values enshrined in the Constitution remain intact and are not compromised for immediate political gains.

It ensures that the Constitution remains a living document capable of adapting to the changing needs of society while maintaining its core values. By protecting the basic structure the doctrine helps prevent the erosion of democratic principles and the consolidation of power in the hands of any single authority thereby preventing any potential abuse of power.

Furthermore, the Doctrine of Basic Structure reinforces the separation of powers by guaranteeing the independence of the judiciary. It prohibits the legislature from tampering with the structure of the judiciary ensuring a robust and impartial judicial system. This independence plays a pivotal role in upholding the rule of law and serves as a check on the executive and legislative branches.

### **IMPORTANCE OF THE DOCTRINE IN CONTEMPORARY INDIA**

In contemporary India, the Basic Structure Doctrine continues to play a vital role in preserving the democratic fabric of the nation. It serves as an essential tool in curbing unconstitutional amendments and protecting the fundamental rights and freedoms of the citizens.

The doctrine has been invoked in several critical cases such as the famous judgment in the *Indira Gandhi v. Raj Narain* case where the Supreme Court declared certain clauses of the 39th Amendment to be conflicting with the basic structure of the Constitution. The doctrine acted as a safeguard against potential erosion of democratic principles during a politically charged period.

The Doctrine of Basic Structure acts as a check on the power of the Parliament to amend the Constitution. While the Parliament has the authority to amend the Constitution it cannot do so in a manner that destroys or damages its basic structure. This ensures that any amendment made by the Parliament is subject to judicial review and can be struck down if it violates the basic structure.

The Doctrine of Basic Structure has played a crucial role in the evolution and development of the Constitution. It has allowed the Supreme Court to interpret and expand upon the fundamental rights enshrined in the Constitution in light of changing societal norms and values. For example, the court has used the Doctrine of Basic Structure to expand the scope of Article 21 which guarantees the right to life and personal liberty to include a wide range of rights such as the right to privacy right to health, and the right to clean environment. Furthermore, the Doctrine of Basic Structure has also been used to

protect and promote the principles of federalism and decentralization of power. The court has held that any amendment that alters the federal character of the Constitution or shifts the balance of power between the Union and the states would be violative of the basic structure.

Moreover, the Doctrine of Basic Structure has been instrumental in protecting the secular character of the Indian state ensuring religious freedom, and preventing discrimination based on religion. It has been invoked in cases concerning the rights of marginalized communities' reservation policies and the right to privacy to name a few. In recent years the Doctrine of Basic Structure has been invoked in several high-profile cases. In the case of National Judicial Appointments Commission v. Union of India in 2015 the court held that any attempt to alter the independence of the judiciary would be violative of the basic structure. Similarly, in the case of Navtej Singh Johar v. Union of India in 2018, the court struck down a colonial-era provision that criminalized consensual same-sex relationships because it violated the basic structure of equality and non-discrimination.

**Conclusion-** The Doctrine of Basic Structure is a testament to the resilience and dynamism of the Indian Constitution. It acts as a safeguard against undemocratic practices and unconstitutional amendments ensuring that the values and principles enshrined in the Constitution remain intact. By protecting the basic structure the doctrine upholds the principles of democracy rule of law and separation of powers allowing India to continue its journey as a vibrant democratic nation. It serves as a constant reminder that the Constitution is not an instrument to be manipulated by political interests but a sacred document that represents the aspirations and rights of the Indian people.

The doctrine of basic structure serves as a bulwark in protecting the integrity and stability of a constitution. By preserving fundamental values protecting individual rights maintaining the balance of power and promoting constitutional consistency this doctrine plays a crucial role in safeguarding the democratic fabric of a nation. Despite some challenges and criticisms the doctrine has proven to be an effective tool in preventing unwarranted tampering with constitutional principles ensuring the Constitution remains an unwavering compass guiding the nation towards progress and justice.

The Doctrine of Basic Structure is a crucial aspect of the Indian Constitution that safeguards its integrity and protects essential principles. This research paper has explored the legal foundations evolution and elements of the Basic Structure Doctrine along with relevant case laws. It is important to understand and uphold this doctrine to ensure the longevity and efficacy of India's constitutional framework.

It is a vital safeguard that ensures the stability and integrity of the Indian Constitution. It acts as a check on the powers of the Parliament and ensures that any amendment to the Constitution does not undermine the core values and principles of the Constitution. The doctrine along with the relevant articles and landmark cases provides a comprehensive framework for the interpretation and protection of the basic structure of the Constitution.

It is a fundamental concept in the interpretation and development of the Constitution of India. It ensures that the basic principles and values enshrined in the Constitution remain intact and protected from arbitrary alteration. The doctrine acts as a check on the power of the Parliament to amend the Constitution and has played a crucial role in the evolution of the Constitution. It provides a framework for the Supreme Court to interpret and expand upon the fundamental rights and principles enshrined

in the Constitution and have been instrumental in protecting and promoting federalism and decentralization of power.

It acts as a check against arbitrary amendments and ensures the preservation of core principles and values of the Constitution. However its scope and application has been a subject of debate and interpretation. The recent ruling on reservations in promotions has further ignited discussions on the practical implementation of the doctrine. As the Constitution evolves and society changes the doctrine of basic structure will continue to be tested and adapted to maintain the spirit of the Indian Constitution.